

**This report is a description of events for receiving PO 579998
(CMS LT04 Tapes)**

Stan Naymola
May 30, 2008

The PO was placed Apr 17th. The tapes arrived at FermiLab on May 1.

The Shipping and Receiving Department received the order and did not mark on the receiving documents or logs that there was any damage to the pallet of tapes. I confirmed this by speaking to Dave Myers who works in Shipping and Receiving. The pallet was moved to FCC by Shipping and Receiving and the Facilities Support Services Group received the pallet on May 1, 2008. Justin Wigg of the Facilities Support Services Group staff, noticed on inspection of the shipment that there was a rub mark on one of the boxes on top of the pallet. The whole order was wrapped in shipping plastic. This is of the type that you wrap around the materials many times to secure the boxes to each other and the pallet. This is how the shipment was received by the FermiLab Shipping and Receiving department. Because of the way the boxes were secured, it was not obvious to the casual observer that there was damage.

The damage was such that it looked like a fork lift truck arm had rested on the box in a manner that it caused a compression of the packing materials and tapes to the point that the packing material was deformed on both ends of the tapes top and bottom. All the force of the compression went through the tapes. I had this box of twenty tapes pulled from the order and put aside, this was on May 2, 2008. Facilities Support Services Group staff went back to Shipping and Receiving to ask if any body had noted any damage when the pallet came in. They said no. On May 2, 2008 the Facilities Support Services Group contacted the vendor of the tapes, MIDWEST COMPUTER PRODUCTS INC and told them about the damage and asked if they would replace them. They said no. They cited that since our Shipping and Receiving Department had not noted any damage initially, they could not determine if the damage was caused after the shipment arrived at FermiLab. Then the vendor on the phone and Facilities Support Services Group staff opened the damaged box to determine the extent of the damage internally. From examination, they determined that only 10 of the tapes in the clam shell container had been compressed. They also noted that there was no external visible damage to the tapes in the damaged area of the clam shell container. But it did look like the force of the compression was transmitted to the tape media because the clam shell had damage on both the top and bottom in that area. The box was put aside until I came back from two weeks of vacation.

When I came back I asked Joe Morgan on May 20, 2008 about asking the vendor to replace these tapes and he indicated that since FermiLab is self insured Computing Division would have to absorb the cost, additionally FermiLab probably could only get about \$100 dollars in a claim to the shipping company. As a note the time to file a claim is with in one week after receiving the shipment. That would have needed to be done by May 8, 2008. That time has passed. We missed that date.

So in review,

- The shipment was received at Shipping and Receiving and no damage was noted.
- The shipment was transfered to FCC by Shipping and Receiving and the Facilities Support Services Group staff noticed the damage on one of the boxes on the pallet.
- The damaged box was pulled from the order.
- The selling vendor did not feel they had to replace the damaged box.

- BSS said we are self insured in these matters and we would have to absorb the cost. ~\$1480.
- We had missed the date to file a claim with the transport vendor.
- I have the box of 20 tapes in my office. We could use 10 of them since there is no damage to that side of the claim shell.

The lessons learned. I don't think the Facilities Support Services Group staff could do any thing more than they did. They noticed the damage after they received the pallet. They helped to facilitate information about the damage and contacted the same people I would have. We could go back to Shipping and Receiving and review with them how this could have happened and they could update their process to receive product coming to FermiLab.

Possible suggestions that could help avoid this in the future.

1. Talk to Shipping and Receiving about how to inspect and accept shipments such as these. Maybe a different approach can be used to ensure that CD sees the shipment before shipments are received. I don't know how easy or hard that is but it is worth a discussion.
2. Why is there a limit of \$100 on shipping damage? Does that make sense for these large dollar shipments? Is it only for those that are already accepted and are found damaged later? I have asked Joe Morgan for clarification in these areas.
3. We should ask how often this sort of things happens - damaged items that are not noticed until they get to the final destination.